



JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Fifty-fifth Session

GENERAL STANDARD FOR FOOD ADDITIVES (GSFA): REPORT OF THE ELECTRONIC WORKING GROUP ON THE GSFA

Prepared by the United States of America with the assistance of Australia, Brazil, Canada, Chile, China, European Union, India, Indonesia, Japan, Kenya, Republic of Korea, Nigeria, Peru, Russian Federation, Senegal, Singapore, South Africa, Thailand, United Kingdom, Vietnam, Zimbabwe, Calorie Control Council (CCC), Collagen Casing Trade Association (CCTA), Food Industry Asia (FIA), Fédération internationale des vins et spiritueux (FIVS), FoodDrinkEurope, International Association of Color Manufacturers (IACM), International Sweeteners Association (ISA), International Special Dietary Foods Industries (ISDI), Natural Food Colours Association (NATCOL), Oenological Products and Practices International Association (Oenopia)

Introduction

1. CCFA54 agreed to establish an EWG to provide recommendations to CCFA55 on the following topics:¹
 - (i) Replies from CCFO28 on the technological justification for the use of paprika extract (INS 160c (ii) in FC 02.2.2 of the GSFA;
 - (ii) Revocation of the adopted provision for annatto extracts, bixin based (INS 160b(i)) in FC 01.2.1;
 - (iii) The adopted provision for aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1 for comment on the actual use level and application of the alternative Note;
 - (iv) The draft, and proposed draft provisions, respectively, for colours in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories as well as adopted provisions for colours with Note 161 in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories with the exception of colours addressed in bullet points i and ii above; and
 - (v) Provisions entered at Step 2 of the GSFA contained in CRD02 Annex 5 (also presented in REP24/FA Appendix IX)

Working Documents

2. The working documents for the report of the EWG on the *General standard for food additives* (GSFA, CXS 192-1995) are presented as appendices to this document. The appendices provide background on the topic under discussion, collate comments on the topic from the EWG, and provide recommendations for each topic.

- proposals for provisions related to replies from CCFO28 that pertain to topic i are presented in Appendix 1.
- proposals for provisions related to revocation of the adopted provision for annatto extracts, bixin based (INS 160b(i)) that pertain to topic ii are presented in Appendix 1.
- proposals for provisions related to colours that pertain to topic iv are presented in Appendix 1.
- proposal for the adopted provision for aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1 related to topic iii are presented in Appendix 2.
- proposals for provisions entered into the step process by CCFA54 that pertain to topic v are presented in Appendix 3.

¹ REP24/FA, para. 105

Appendix 1**COLOURS IN FCS 01.0 THROUGH TO 08.0 AND THEIR SUBCATEGORIES**

1. Among several topics, the 54th CCFA requested the EWG on the GSFA to the 55th CCFA to consider:²
 - Replies of the Codex Committee on Fats and Oils (CCFO);
 - Revocation of the adopted provision for Annatto extracts, bixin based (INS 160b(i)) in FC 01.2.1;
 - Draft and proposed draft provisions for colours in FCs 01.0 through 08.0 and their subcategories; and
 - Adopted provisions for colours with Note 161 in FCs 01.0 through 08.0 and their subcategories.

Introduction:**Background on Replies of the Codex Committee on Fats and Oils (CCFO):**

2. The electronic work group on the GSFA to CCFA53 compiled provisions in food categories 01.0 (Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0), 02.0 (Fats and oils, and fat emulsions), and 03.0 (Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet) and their subcategories. When discussing the provision for Paprika Extract (INS 160c(ii)) in food category 02.2.2 it was noted that, while the commodity standards which correspond to this food category (Standard for Dairy Fat Spreads (CXS 253-2006) and the Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Spreads (CXS 256-1999)) list specific food additives for use as colours, INS 160c(ii) is not included in these commodity standards. It was noted that the JECFA evaluation for INS 160c(ii) was only recently completed, and therefore Paprika extract was not eligible for inclusion in these commodity standards when they were finalized. It was also determined that at least one of the standards for food category 02.2.2 fell under the purview of the Codex Committee on Fats and Oils (CCFO) which is an active commodity committee.

3. The CCFA53 agreed to hold the provision for Paprika extract (INS 160c (ii)) in food category 02.2.2 at its current step and request from CCFO the technological justification for the use and use level in products conforming to the CXS 253-2006 and CXS 256-1999.

4. In response to the request from CCFA53, CCFO28 agreed that there is no technological justification for the use of paprika extract (INS 160c (ii)) in products conforming to CXS 256-1999. They also noted that CXS 253-2006 was outside the purview of CCFO.

Background on Revocation of the adopted provision for Annatto extracts, bixin based (INS 160b(i)) in FC 01.2.1:

5. During the electronic work group on Alignment to CCFA53, the Chair noted that the adopted provision for Annatto extracts, bixin based (INS 160b(i)) in FC 01.2.1 (*Fermented milks (plain)*) was likely listed in error, since it is unusual for plain products to have colours permitted and the presence of the XS Notes 33 and 210 are relevant to fats and oils.

6. CCFA54 endorsed the recommendation to have the provision considered for revocation by the GSFA EWG for CCFA54.

Background on Draft, and proposed draft provisions, respectively, for colours in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories as well as adopted provisions for colours with Note 161 in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories:

7. To continue to advance provisions for colours through the step process, CCFA54 requested that the GSFA EWG for CCFA55 consider the provisions for colours, both adopted provisions with Note 161 associated with them and provisions in the step process, in food categories 01.0 (*Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0*), 02.0 (*Fats and oils, and fat emulsions*), 03.0 (*Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet*), 04.0 (*Fruits and vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera)*), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds), 05.0 (Confectionery), 06.0 (*Cereals and cereal products derived from cereal grains, roots and tubers, pulses, legumes and pith or soft core of palm tree, excluding bakery wares of food category 07.0*), 07.0 (*Includes categories for bread and ordinary bakery wares (07.1) and for sweet, salty and savoury fine bakery wares (07.2)*), 08.0 (*Meat and meat products, including poultry and game*) and their subcategories.

Working Document:

² REP 24/FA, para. 105(i, ii, and iv)

8. The EWG on the GSFA issued three circulars for this Appendix requesting comments on the draft and proposed draft provisions for colours in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories as well as adopted provisions for colours in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories.
9. The current document presents proposals for each provision under discussion (adopt, adopt with revision, discontinue) in the format of the food categories listed in Table 2 of the GSFA.
10. These proposals are based upon a consensus approach taking into account the following information:
- Information on corresponding Codex commodity standards and the use of food additives in those commodity standards is provided for each food category;
 - Comments from the CCFO on the technological justification of Paprika extract (INS 160c (ii) in food category 02.2;
 - Additional Information as appropriate; and
 - Compilation of the first and second circular comments.
11. These recommendations are based on the “weight of evidence”; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.
12. A full compilation of comments submitted for Appendix 1 (Colours in FCs 01.0 through to 08.0 and their subcategories) to the three circulars are available [here](#).

Comments from the Codex Committee on Fats and Oils (CCFO) on the use of the food additives in food categories:

CCFO replied to CCFA that there is no technological justification for the use of paprika extract (INS 160c(ii)) in products conforming to CXS 256-1999. They also noted that CXS 253-2006 was outside the purview of CCFO.³

Note from EWG Chair: CXS 253-2006 is under the purview of the Codex Committee on Milk and Milk Products (CCMMP) which is adjourned sine die. Therefore, the technological justification for the use of food additives in food categories corresponding to CCMMP standards are now under the purview of CCFA. As such, the use of paprika extract (INS 160c(ii)) in products conforming to CXS 253-2006 will be under discussion by the GSFA EWG for CCFA55. Since this provision was under discussion by the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53, comments provided at that time might be considered to advise on the use of paprika extract (INS 160c (ii)) in products conforming to CXS 253-2006 (see [CCFA53 GSFA EWG Report](#)).

Category No. 02.2.2 (Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 253-2006: Colours are permitted in accordance with GSFA; CODEX STAN 256-2007: Permits use of specific colours

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Chair's note: *As noted by several EWG members, this provision for Paprika extract was repeated in Annex 3, below. We have combined comments for both copies of the provision in Annex 1, and will remove the duplicative provision in Annex 3.*

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	40	39	3	Colour	Adopt at 40 mg/kg with Note 39 and Note XS256

³ REP24/FA, para. 23 and 24

Revocation of the adopted provision for Annatto extracts, bixin based (INS 160b(i)) in FC 01.2.1

The PWG for Alignment at CCFA54 noted that the provision for Annatto extracts, bixin-based (INS 160b(i)) was likely included in the GSFA by error as food category 01.2.1 (Fermented milks (plain)) is a “plain” food category, and plain food categories do not typically contain colours.⁴ The provision was forwarded to the GSFA EWG for CCFA55 for consideration of revocation.⁵

EWG members were encouraged to provide comments on the proposal to revoke the provision for Annatto extracts, bixin-based (INS 160b(i)) in food category 01.2.1.

Category No. 01.2.1 (Fermented milks (plain))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 243-2003: Does not permit colours in plain products

GSFA: Parent FC is in the Annex to Table 3. One colour has previously been adopted in this FC.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	10	8, 508, 509, XS33, XS210	2021	Colour	Revoke provision

⁴ CCFA54 CRD 3 (Rev), Recommendation 3

⁵ REP24/FA, para. 105ii

Draft and proposed draft provisions for colours and adopted provisions for colours with Note 161 in food categories 01.0 through 08.0 and their subcategories

The EWG was invited to provide comment on the draft and proposed draft provisions with the functional class of colours and adopted provisions for colours with Note 161 in food categories 01.0 (Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0), 02.0 (Fats and oils, and fat emulsions), 03.0 (Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet), 04.0 (Fruits and vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds), 05.0 (Confectionery), 06.0 (Cereals and cereal products derived from cereal grains, roots and tubers, pulses, legumes and pith or soft core of palm tree, excluding bakery wares of food category 07.0), 07.0 (Includes categories for bread and ordinary bakery wares (07.1) and for sweet, salty and savoury fine bakery wares (07.2)), 08.0 (Meat and meat products, including poultry and game) and their subcategories. When a food additive provision from a parent food category is considered in the corresponding subcategories the provision is indicated in the subcategory in **bolded font** with no Step indicated in the “Step/Adopted” column. However, if the provision from the parent category is an adopted provision, the year adopted is shown in parentheses (e.g. (2009)) to remind the user that the parent provision is an adopted provision.

Category No. 01.6.2 (Ripened cheese)

Corresponding commodity standards: Commodity Standards associated with subcategories

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ZEAXANTHIN, SYNTHETIC	161h(i)	100		4	Colour	Discontinue: Zeaxanthin, synthetic is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 01.6.2 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Category No. 02.1.2 (Vegetable oils and fats)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 19-1981: Section 3.1 states colours are not permitted in vegetable oils but then specific colours are permitted for the purpose of restoring natural colour lost in processing or for the purpose of standardizing colour – unclear if this use is allowed in vegetable oils, **CODEX STAN 33-1981, CODEX STAN 210-1999, CODEX STAN 325R-2017:** Colours are not permitted

GSFA: Parent FC is in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CHLOROPHYLLS	140	GMP		7	Colour	Discontinue

Food Category No. 04.1.1.2 (Surface treated fresh fruit)**Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 143-1985:** Lists specific emulsifiers**GSFA:** Parent FC is in the Annex to Table 3.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	4,16 & 185	4	Colour	Discontinue
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BEET RED	162	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BROWN HT	155	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CHLOROPHYLLS	140	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
TITANIUM DIOXIDE	171	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.1.2 (Processed fruit)**Corresponding commodity standards:** Commodity Standards associated with subcategories**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R	4	Colour	Discontinue provision in parent category 04.1.2 and consider in subcategories 04.1.2.2 through 04.1.2.12.

Category No. 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 067-1981: Lists sulphur dioxide, mineral oil, and sorbitol, CODEX STAN 130-1981: Lists sorbic acid and its sodium and potassium salts, CODEX STAN 177-1991: Lists sulphur dioxide;

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Do not consider in this subcategory.
TARTRAZINE	102	200		7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.1.2.3 (Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 260-2007: Acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, antioxidants, colours, colour retention agents, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sequestrants, stabilizers and sweeteners in which the individual pickled fruit or vegetable fall into (i.e., one of the following categories: 04.1.2.3, 04.1.2.10, 04.2.2.3, and 04.2.2.7)

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg.
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	1500	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 1500 mg/kg; - Remove Note 161; and - Add New Note "For use with red fruits only"

Category No. 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 017-1981:** Only certain acidifying agents, antioxidants and flavourings are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 060-1981:** Only certain colours are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 062-1987:** Only certain acidifying agents, colours and firming agents are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 078-1981:** Only certain colours, flavourings, and antioxidants are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 099-1981:** Only certain colours, flavourings, acidifying agents, antioxidants and firming agents are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 242-2003:** Only certain acidifying agents, antioxidants, colours and flavourings are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 254-2007:** Acidity regulators and firming agents used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard; **CODEX STAN 319-2015:** Only those food additive classes listed below and in the corresponding Annexes are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Within each additive class only those food additives listed in the corresponding Annexes, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified. Acidity regulators used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. ANNEX ON CANNED MANGOES—Antioxidants, colours, and firming agents used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in Food Category 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Annex. Antioxidants, and firming agents listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use for foods conforming to this Annex; ANNEX ON CANNED PEARS—Colours (permitted only in special holiday packs) used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in Food Category 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use for foods conforming to this Annex. Flavourings used in products covered by this Annex should comply with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CAC/GL 66-2008); and ANNEX ON CANNED PINEAPPLE—Antifoaming agents and antioxidants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in Food Category 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Annex. Flavourings used in products covered by this Annex shall comply with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CAC/GL 66-2008).

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AMARANTH	123	200		7	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	200	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 30 mg/kg with - New Note “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 319-2015) except for use at 200 mg/kg in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard.” -New Note: “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Stone Fruits

Category No. 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit)

						(CXS 242-2003) except for use in canned cherries at 30 mg/kg for the purpose of restoring colour lost in processing. Notes 185, XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, and XS254 <i>Chair's Note: If the new note pertaining to the use in canned cherries is agreed by the committee, a proposal will need to be made to revise CXS 242-2003 (which is under the purview of CCFA) accordingly.</i>
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 267 ("Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard.", New Note "For use with red fruits only", Notes XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, XS242 and XS254
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	200		7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	200	161 & 267	2018	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Remove Note 161 -Maintain use level at 200 mg/kg -Maintain Note 267 ("Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 192 319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard." -add New Note "For use with red fruits only" -Add Notes XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, XS242 and XS254
BROWN HT	155	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 267 ("Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 192

Category No. 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit)

						319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard.”, New Note “For use with red fruits only”, Notes XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, XS242 and XS254
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg with Note 267 (“Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 192 319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard” and add New Note “For use with red fruits only”
CURCUMIN	100(i)	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 267 (“Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 192 319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard.”, add Notes XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, XS242 and XS254
ERYTHROSINE	127	200	54 & 161	6	Colour	Revise adopted provision -Remove Note 161 -Revise Note 54 to state: “For use only in non-standardized cocktail cherries and candied cherries, artificially coloured cherries conforming to the Standard for Canned Fruit Cocktail (CXS 78-1981), and sweet cherries conforming to the Standard for Canned Stone Fruits (CXS 242-2003).” -Add XS17, XS254 and XS319 <i>Chair’s Note: The current JECFA exposure estimate for erythrosine (INS 127) only covers use in cocktail cherries and candied cherries at a use level of 200 mg/kg. Based on the JECFA exposure estimate we have proposed to revise note 54 to cover the use of erythrosine in standardized and non-</i>

Category No. 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit)

						standardized cherries. We note that there are two other commodity standards that permit uses of erythrosine beyond just cherries: the Standard for Canned Raspberries (CXS 60-1981) and the Standard for Canned Strawberries (CXS 62-1981). Due to concerns regarding additional exposure, we have not included these uses in the current provision (we have added use for Ponceau 4R from these standards). However, the Alignment EWG is scheduled to consider these standards at CCFA57, and will likely add their uses based on their typical procedures. If the committee considers it appropriate, the EWG for CCFA56 could seek information on the actual use of erythrosine in products conforming to CXS 60-1981 and CXS 62-1981 to help inform the Alignment EWG, and, if necessary, make a proposal to revise the standards if erythrosine is no longer found to be used in products covered by these standards.
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	300	161 & 267	2018	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Remove Note 161 - Replace Note 267 with Note 104 (due to comments by EWG member that INS 124 is permitted in canned mangoes and special holiday packs for canned pears) - add New Note "For use with red fruits only" - Add XS17, XS78, XS99, XS242, and XS254 - Add New Note "Except for products conforming to the Standard for Canned Raspberries (CXS 60-1981): at 300 mg/kg of the final product."

Category No. 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit)

						- Add New Note "Except for products conforming to the Standard for Canned Strawberries (CXS 62-1981) at up to 300 mg/kg of the final product." <i>Chair's Note: As use of erythrosine (INS 127) from CXS 60-1981 and CXS62-1981 was not included in the provision for erythrosine above, we have only included Ponceau 4R in the notes corresponding to CXS 60-1981 and CXS 62-1981.</i>
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 267 ("Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 192 319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard.", New Note "For use with red fruits only", Notes XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, XS242 and XS254
TARTRAZINE	102	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 267 ("Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CXS 192 319-2015) except for use in special holiday packs for canned pears conforming to the standard.", New Note "For use with red fruits only", Notes XS17, XS60, XS62, XS78, XS99, XS242 and XS254

Category No. 04.1.2.5 (Jams, jellies, marmalades)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 296-2009: Only certain acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, colours, and preservatives are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Within each additive class only those food additives listed below, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified. Acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, firming agents, preservatives and thickeners used in accordance with Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Category No. 04.1.2.5 (Jams, jellies, marmalades)

General EU Comment: EU differentiates between 'extra jam and extra jelly' for which no colours are permitted and 'jam, jellies and marmalades' for which a limited number of colours of natural origin is permitted for use.

Category No. 04.1.2.5 (Jams, jellies, marmalades)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg, remove Note 161. <i>Chair's Note: INS 129 is permitted for use in CXS 296-2009 at 100 mg/kg.</i>
AMARANTH	123	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note XS296
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 8 and Note XS296
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185 and Note XS296
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note XS296
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note XS296
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Remove Note 161 - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg <i>Chair's Note: INS 133 is permitted for use in CXS 296-2009 at 100 mg/kg.</i>
BROWN HT	155	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note XS296
CAMEL II - SULFITE CAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 1500 mg/kg

Category No. 04.1.2.5 (Jams, jellies, marmalades)

CHLOROPHYLLS AND CHLOROPHYLLINS, COPPER COMPLEXES	141(i),(ii)	200	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Remove Note 161 - Maintain use level at 200 mg/kg <i>Chair's Note: INS 141(i),(ii) permitted for use in CXS 296-2009 at 200 mg/kg.</i>
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500		7	Colour	Adopt provision at 500 mg/kg <i>Chair's Note: CXS 296 (Standard for Jams, Jellies and Marmalades) permits the use of Curcumin at 500 mg/kg.</i>
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	500	161 & 181	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 500 mg/kg - Remove Note 161, keep Note 181 <i>Chair's Note: CXS 296 (Standard for Jams, Jellies and Marmalades) permits the use of Grape skin extract at 500 mg/kg.</i>
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	300	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 300 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Add Note XS296
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	100		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 04.1.2.5 is not in the Annex to Table 3
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes 39 and XS296
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	100	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161

Category No. 04.1.2.5 (Jams, jellies, marmalades)

						<i>Chair's Note: CXS 296 (Standard for Jams, Jellies and Marmalades) permits the use of Ponceau 4R at 100 mg/kg.</i>
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg <i>Chair's Note: CXS 296 (Standard for Jams, Jellies and Marmalades) permits the use of Quinoline yellow at 100 mg/kg.</i>
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	300	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 300 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 <i>Chair's Note: CXS 296 (Standard for Jams, Jellies and Marmalades) permits the use of Sunset yellow at 300 mg/kg.</i>
TARTRAZINE	102	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 500 mg/kg Add New Note: "Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Jams, Jellies and Marmalades (CXS 296-2009) except for use in apple jam at 30 mg/kg to restore colour lost during processing." <i>Chair's Note: If the new note pertaining to the use in apple jam is agreed by the committee, a proposal will need to be made to revise CXS 296-2009 (which is under the purview of CCFA) accordingly.</i>

Category No. 04.1.2.6 (Fruit-based spreads (e.g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 160-1987: Acidity regulators and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 04.1.2.6 (Fruit-based spreads (e.g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard and only certain acidity regulators in Table 3 are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 8 and XS160
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 185 and XS160
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note XS160
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500		7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	100	161 & XS160	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg with Note XS160 - Remove Note 161
BROWN HT	155	500		7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Note XS160.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note XS160
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161 & XS160	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg with Note XS160 - Remove Note 161
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	500	161, 181 & XS160	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 500 mg/kg with Notes 181 and XS160 - Remove Note 161
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	300	161 & XS160	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision

Category No. 04.1.2.6 (Fruit-based spreads (e.g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5)

						- Lower use level to 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS160
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	500	161 & XS160	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS160 - Add New Note "Except for use in strawberry-based spread at 400 mg/kg".
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500		7	Colour	Discontinue
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	300	161 & XS160	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS160
TARTRAZINE	102	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Note XS160

Category No. 04.1.2.7 (Candied fruit)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	300	161	2009	Colour	Revised Adopted provision - Lower use level to 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
AMARANTH	123	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 8
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	200		7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
BROWN HT	155	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg
CAMEL II - SULFITE CAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg
CURCUMIN	100(i)	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	200	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	200		4	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.1.2.7 (Candied fruit)

						<i>Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 04.1.2.7 is not in the Annex to Table 3</i>
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 39
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	200	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	200	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
TARTRAZINE	102	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg
ZEAXANTHIN, SYNTHETIC	161h(i)	200		4	Colour	Discontinue: Zeaxanthin, synthetic is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 04.1.2.7 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Category No. 04.1.2.8 (Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 240-2003: Only certain bleaching agents, emulsifiers, preservatives, and stabilizers/thickeners are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 314R-2013:** No food additives permitted

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step/ Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	300	161, 182 & XS314R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161

Category No. 04.1.2.8 (Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk)

						- Remove Note 182 - Maintain XS314R - Add XS240 (replaces Note 182)
AMARANTH	123	300	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8 & 182, XS314R	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Notes 8, XS240 (replaces Note 182), XS314R
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	172, 182 & 185, XS314R	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 185, XS240 (replaces Note 182), XS314R. Do not include Note 172 (Note 172 includes a reference for use at higher levels in coconut milk, which is not permitted)
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS240, XS314R and New Note <i>"For use with red fruits only"</i>
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	100	161, 182 & XS314R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision

Category No. 04.1.2.8 (Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk)

						- Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Remove Note 182 - Maintain XS314R - Add Note XS240 (replaces Note 182)
BROWN HT	155	500	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg with Note XS240 (replaces note 182) and XS314R.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Adopt at 300 mg/kg with Notes XS240 and XS314R.
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161, 182 & XS314R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Remove Note 182 - Maintain XS314R

Category No. 04.1.2.8 (Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk)

						- Add Note XS240 (replaces Note 182)
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	150	161, 182 & XS314R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 150 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Remove Note 182 - Maintain XS314R - Add Note XS240 (replaces Note 182)
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39 & XS314R	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes 39, XS240 and XS314R
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	50	161, 182 & XS314R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 50 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Remove Note 182 - Maintain XS314R

Category No. 04.1.2.8 (Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk)

						- Add Note XS240 (replaces Note 182)
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes XS240 and XS314R.
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	300	161, 182 & XS314R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Remove Note 182 - Maintain XS314R - Add Note XS240 (replaces Note 182)
TARTRAZINE	102	500	182, XS314R	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note XS240 (replaces Note 182) and XS314R

Category No. 04.1.2.9 (Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	300	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision

Category No. 04.1.2.9 (Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts)

						- Maintain use level at 300 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
AMARANTH	123	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 80 mg/kg
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	30	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 30 mg/kg with Note 8 and New Note "Except for use at 100 mg/kg in jelly desserts and fruit-flavoured jelly"
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	150	175 & 185	4	Colour	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with Note 185
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg
BROWN HT	155	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 30 mg/kg
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	500	161 & 181	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 500 mg/kg with Note 181 - Remove Note 161
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	150	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 150 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	150		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 04.1.2.9 is not in the Annex to Table 3
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 80 mg/kg with Note 39
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	50	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision

Category No. 04.1.2.9 (Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts)

						- Maintain use level at 50 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 70 mg/kg
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	50	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 50 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
TARTRAZINE	102	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg
ZEAXANTHIN, SYNTHETIC	161h(i)	150		4	Colour	Discontinue: Zeaxanthin, synthetic is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 04.1.2.9 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Category No. 04.1.2.10 (Fermented fruit products)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 260-2007: Acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, antioxidants, colours, colour retention agents, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sequestrants, stabilizers and sweeteners in which the individual pickled fruit or vegetable fall into (i.e., one of the following categories: 04.1.2.3, 04.1.2.10, 04.2.2.3, and 04.2.2.7)

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	200	185	4	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Do not consider in this food category
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	500	161 & 181	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 500 mg/kg with Note 181 - Remove Note 161

Food Category No. 04.1.2.11 (Fruit fillings for pastries)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	300	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 300 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
AMARANTH	123	300		7	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	50	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 8
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	200	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 35 mg/kg
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Adopt at 7500 mg/kg.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	500	161 & 181	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 500 mg/kg with Note 181 - Remove Note 161
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	150	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 150 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	150		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 04.1.2.11 is not in the Annex to Table 3
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 39

Food Category No. 04.1.2.11 (Fruit fillings for pastries)

PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	50	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 50 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	300	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
TARTRAZINE	102	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg

Category No. 04.1.2.12 (Cooked fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	185	4	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	182, XS160, XS314R		Colour	Do not consider in this food category

Category No. 04.2.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 330-2018: Does not discuss food additives; CODEX STAN 337-2020: Does not discuss food additives; CODEX STAN 339-2020: Does not discuss food additives

GSFA: Parent FC is in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

General comments on FC 04.2.1.2 by EWG members on the 1st Circular:

Australia: Similar to the comparable FC 04.1.1.2 Australia notes that there are currently provisions for four colours Carmines (120) carotenes (160a), Riboflavins (101 (i)-(iv)) and sunset yellow FCF (110) in this FC, also with the same notes 4 & 16. In essence the colours can only be used for decorations, stamping, marking or branding the fresh vegetables.

Australia does not permit the use of colours for this purpose.

If there is good technological justification for why these additional colours are required for the same purpose then unless there are safety concerns then they seem reasonable.

China: Suggests discontinuation.

Generally, food additives used in FC 04.2.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds) are supposed to act as protective coatings and /or help to preserve the freshness and quality of the vegetables. However, it seems unlikely colors can serve such purposes. China does not allow the use of colors in this FC.

Category No. 04.2.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BEET RED	162	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BROWN HT	155	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CALCIUM CARBONATE	170(i)	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CHLOROPHYLLS	140		4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.2.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
TITANIUM DIOXIDE	171	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.2.2 (Processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 038-1981: Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; Commodity Standards associated with subcategories

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CARAMEL II – SULFITE CARAMEL	150 b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	4	Colour	Discontinue in this category and consider in subcategories 04.2.2.2 through 04.2.2.8.
CARAMEL IV – SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150 d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	2024	Colour	Revoke in this category and consider in subcategories 04.2.2.2 through 04.2.2.8.

Category No. 04.2.2.2 (Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 038-1981:** Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; **CODEX STAN 039-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 321-2015:** No food additives permitted; **CODEX STAN 323R-2017:** Dried Laver Products and Roasted Laver Product—No food additives are permitted, Seasoned Laver Products Only acidity regulators, anticaking agents, flavour enhancers, sweeteners, thickeners and antioxidants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food categories 04.2.2.2 and 04.2.2.8 or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in seasoned laver products (see Section 2.3.3) conforming to this standard; **CODEX STAN 336R-2020:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 341R -2020:** No food additives are permitted in Grade 1 and Grade 2 mixed zaatar. Only Citric Acid (INS 330) is permitted in Grade 3 mixed zaatar (Table 3)

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320 XS323R		Colour	Do not consider in this food category

Category No. 04.2.2.2 (Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	50000	76, 161, XS323R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 50000 mg/kg - Maintain notes 76 and XS323R - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS38, XS39, XS321, XS336R, and XS341R <i>Chair's Note:</i> Please comment on the use level. Is this high a use level actually necessary?
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Do not consider in

Category No. 04.2.2.2 (Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

						this food category
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	XS323R	4	Colour	Discontinue
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	70	39, XS323R	2	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	300	XS323R	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS39, XS321, XS323R, XS336R, XS341R and New Note "Except for use in powdered wasabi at 940 mg/kg"

Category No. 04.2.2.3 (Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 038-1981: Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; **CODEX STAN 066-1981:** Acidity regulators, antioxidants, colour retention agents¹, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, and thickeners² used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 04.2.2.3 (Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard; **CODEX STAN 115-1981:** Only certain solubilizing and dispersing agents, firming agents, preservatives, colours, thickening agents, acidifiers, and flavourings are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 260-2007:** Acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, antioxidants, colours, colour retention agents, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sequestrants, stabilizers and sweeteners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in the food category in which the individual pickled fruit or vegetable fall into (i.e., one of the following categories: 04.1.2.3, 04.1.2.10, 04.2.2.3, and 04.2.2.7) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

General comments on FC 04.2.2.3 by EWG members on the 1st circular:

Canada: The adoption of several colours in this food category is problematic with respect to creating divergence with standards, because CXS 115 permits limited colours, but more importantly, with a limited maximum level set on the combination of all colours used. While divergence for other standards can be mitigated via the use of XS Notes, it cannot be done for CXS 115 without a more specific note. The issue is further complicated by the fact that not all of the colours permitted by the standard are adopted in the GSFA or proposed for consideration below, meaning that any proposed note to fully accommodate the standard would not be consistent with the GSFA provisions. To illustrate, using the proposed note shown below:

“Except for use in products conforming to the *Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles)* (CXS 115-1981): annatto extract, bixin-based (INS 160b(i)), brilliant blue FCF (INS 133), caramel I – plain caramel (INS 150a), caramel IV – sulfite ammonia caramel (INS 150d), CAROTENES, BETA-, CHLOROPHYLLS AND CHLOROPHYLLINS, COPPER COMPLEXES, curcumin (INS 100(i)), fast green FCF (INS 143), paprika extract (INS 160c(ii)), RIBOFLAVINS, sunset yellow FCF (INS 110), and tartrazine (INS 102), at up to 300 mg/kg, singly or in combination.”

This note addresses the colour provisions in the standard; however, sunset yellow FCF is not in FC 04.2.2.3, nor is it being considered below. Therefore, a note containing information on the use of sunset yellow FCF would be confusing. Canada suggests two possible options to avoid creating further divergence, with our preference for the first option:

- (1) Limit the additives contained in the note to only those present or being considered for inclusion in the GSFA; or
- (2) Consider adding the remainder of the additives in the note to the GSFA (this would require the CCFA to also consider the justifications for those additives in non-standardized foods).

We would note that the first option would represent a “partial alignment”, and the remainder of the colours could be added or amended in the GSFA through the work of the EWG on Alignment. If option (1) is considered, we would propose that the note applicable to CXS 115-1981, for the time-being, read as follows:

“Except for use in products conforming to the *Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles)* (CXS 115-1981): annatto extract, bixin-based (INS 160b(i)), brilliant blue FCF (INS 133), caramel I – plain caramel (INS 150a), caramel IV – sulfite ammonia caramel (INS 150d), CAROTENES, BETA-, curcumin (INS 100(i)), fast green FCF (INS 143), paprika extract (INS 160c(ii)), and tartrazine (INS 102), at up to 300 mg/kg, singly or in combination.”

While CXS 115 only lists “annatto extract” (i.e., not specific to either the bixin-based or norbixin-based form), the bixin-based form was assumed because the ADI for the norbixin-based form is more limited and an appropriate maximum level is unknown. As such, we suggest the norbixin-based form have Note XS115 attached to it. All other colours (not listed in the proposed note) under consideration, below, should also have Note XS115 attached to them.

Category No. 04.2.2.3 (Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	300	161 & XS66	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 300 mg/kg with Note XS66 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS38, XS115 and XS260
AMARANTH	123	300	XS66	7	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS66, XS115 and XS260
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8, XS66	4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes 8, XS38, XS66, XS260 and New Note "Except for use at 300 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles) (CXS 115-1981), singly or in combination, with other colours permitted in CXS 115-1981.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	300	185, XS66	4	Colour	Discontinue
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500	XS66	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS66, XS115 and XS260.
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500	XS66	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS66, XS115 and XS260.
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	500	161 & XS66	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 500 mg/kg with Note XS66 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS38, XS260 and New Note "Except for use at 300 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles) (CXS 115-1981), singly or in combination, with other colours permitted in CXS 115-1981.
BROWN HT	155	500	XS66	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294,		Colour	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS66, XS115 and XS260.

Category No. 04.2.2.3 (Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce)

			XS308R, XS320 XS323R			
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS66, XS115 and XS260
CARMINES	120	500	161, 178 & XS66	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 200 mg/kg with Notes 178 and XS66 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS38, XS115 and XS260.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	XS66	7	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS66, XS260 and New Note "Except for use at 300 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles) (CXS 115-1981), singly or in combination, with other colours permitted in CXS 115-1981.
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	150	161 & XS66	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 150 mg/kg with Note XS66 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS38, XS115 and XS260.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	75	39, XS66	2	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Notes 39, XS38, XS66, XS260 and New Note "Except for use at 300 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles) (CXS 115-1981), singly or in combination, with other colours permitted in CXS 115-1981." <i>Chair's Note: As correctly noted by Canada, the situation for CXS 115-1981 is rather complicated as the standard incorporates a use level of "singly or in combination" at 300 mg/kg for multiple colours, not all of which have provisions in the step process for the GSFA. We are proposing the new</i>

Category No. 04.2.2.3 (Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce)

						<i>note listed above as a temporary fix until CXS 115-1981 is fully aligned by the Alignment EWG. CXS 115 lists the colour “oleoresin of paprika”. However, this colour is likely currently referred by JECFA and the INS as “Paprika extract” when used as a colour. The current JECFA specifications monograph for Paprika oleoresin indicates its use as a flavouring agent, not a colour. Some of these issues may be reopened when the Alignment EWG works to align CXS 115 with the GSFA.</i>
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500	XS66	7	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	500	XS66	7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Notes 39, XS38, XS66, XS260 and New Note “Except for use at 300 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles) (CXS 115-1981), singly or in combination, with other colours permitted in CXS 115-1981.”

Category No. 04.2.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 013-1981:** Firming agents listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) and certain other Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard; **CODEX STAN 038-1981:** Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; **CODEX STAN 057-1981:** only certain Table 3 acidity regulators are permitted ; **CODEX STAN 145-1985:** Only certain chelating agents, antioxidants, acidifying agents, bleaching agent, colours, flavourings and thickening agents are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Firming agents used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in Food Category 04.2.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use for foods conforming to this Annex; **CODEX STAN 241-2003:** Acidity regulators used in accordance with Table 3 of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard; **CODEX STAN 257R-2007:** Only certain acidity regulators, anticaking agents and stabilizers are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 258R-2007:** Only certain acidity regulators, antioxidants, and preservatives are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 297-2009:** Only those food additive classes listed below and in the corresponding Annexes are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Only certain colours and colour retention agents are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard and in the corresponding Annexes, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified. Acidity regulators, colours, colour retention agents and calcium salts of firming agents used in accordance with Table 3 of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. ANNEX ON SWEET CORN—Only certain thickeners are technologically justified and may be used and ANNEX ON CERTAIN MUSHROOMS—thickeners, emulsifiers and stabilizers used in accordance with Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) for food category 04.2.2.4 are acceptable for use in canned mushrooms in sauce only. Only the colour listed below is permitted for use in canned mushroom in sauce.

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED	129	200	161 & XS57	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 200 mg/kg and Note XS57 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS13, XS38, XS145, XS241, XS257R, XS258R and XS297.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	10	185, XS57	4	Colour	Discontinue
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	200	XS57	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.2.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds)

BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	200	XS57	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS13, XS38, XS57, XS145, XS241, XS257R, XS258R and XS297.
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	200	161 & XS57	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 200 mg/kg and Note XS57 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS13, XS38, XS145, XS241, XS257R, XS258R and New Note "Except for use at 20 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Vegetables (CXS 297-2009)."
BROWN HT	155	200	XS57	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320 XS323R		Colour	Do not consider in this food category
CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	50000	161 & XS57	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 50000 mg/kg and Note XS57 - Remove Note 161 - Add Notes XS13, XS38, XS145, XS241, XS257R, XS258R and New Note "For products conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Vegetables (CXS 297-2009): only for use in canned mushrooms in sauce."
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Adopt at 50000 mg/kg with Notes XS13, XS38, XS57, XS145, XS241, XS257R and XS258R.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	200	XS57	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS13, XS38, XS57, XS145, XS241, XS257R, XS258R, and XS297.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39, XS57	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes XS13, XS38, XS57, XS145, XS241, XS257R, XS258R, and XS297.

Category No. 04.2.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds)

QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	200	XS57	7	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	200	XS57	7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Notes XS13, XS38, XS57, XS145, XS241, XS257R and XS258R.

Category No. 04.2.2.5 (Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g. peanut butter))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 057-1981: Lists specific acidity regulators

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8, XS57	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 8 and XS57.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185, XS57	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 185 and XS57.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320 XS323R		Colour	Do not consider in this food category
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Adopt at 400 mg/kg with Note XS57.
URCUMIN	100(i)	500	XS57	4	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS57.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39, XS57	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes 39 and XS57.
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	100	XS57	7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Notes XS57.

Category No. 04.2.2.6 (Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g. vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 038-1981: Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; CODEX STAN 057-1981: Lists specific acidity regulators; CODEX STAN 259R-2007: No food additives listed; CODEX STAN 308R-2011: No food additives permitted; CODEX STAN 321-2015: No food additives permitted

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	200	92, 161, XS57, XS308R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Notes 92, XS57 and XS308R - Add notes XS38, XS259R and XS321.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8, 92, XS57, XS308R	4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes 8, 92, XS38, XS57, XS259R, XS308R and XS321.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	10	92, 185, XS57, XS308R	4	Colour	Discontinue
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	200	92, XS57, XS308R	7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	200	92, XS57, XS308R	7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	100	92, 161, XS57, XS308R	2024	Colour	Revoke provision
BROWN HT	155	200	92, XS57, XS308R	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R,		Colour	Do not consider in this food category

Category No. 04.2.2.6 (Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g. vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5)

			XS320 XS323R			
CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	50000	161, XS57, XS308R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 50000 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Notes XS57 and XS308R - Add notes XS38, XS259R and XS321.
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Do not consider in this food category
CURCUMIN	100(i)	200	92, XS57, XS308R	7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes 92, XS38, XS57, XS259R, XS308R and XS321.
INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	200	92, 161, XS57, XS308R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 100 mg/kg. - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Notes XS57 and XS308R - Add notes XS38, XS259R and XS321.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	150	39, XS57, XS308R	2	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes 39, XS38, XS57, XS259R, XS308R, XS321 and New Note "Except for use in salsa at 1200 mg/kg".
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	200	92, XS57, XS308R	7	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	200	92, XS57, XS308R	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 038-1981:** Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; **CODEX STAN 151-1985:** Does not discuss food additives; **CODEX STAN 223-2001:** Only certain acidity regulators, flavour enhancers, flavourings, texturizers and thickening and stabilizing agents are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX STAN 260-2007:** Acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, antioxidants, colours, colour retention agents, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sequestrants, stabilizers and sweeteners in which the individual pickled fruit or vegetable fall into (i.e., one of the following categories: 04.1.2.3, 04.1.2.10, 04.2.2.3, and 04.2.2.7); **CODEX STAN 294-2009:** Acidity regulators, antioxidants, flavour enhancers, preservatives, and stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard

GSFA: FC is in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AMARANTH	123	300		4	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes 8, XS38, XS151, XS223, and XS294.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	200	185	4	Colour	Discontinue
BEET RED	162	GMP		4	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Notes XS38, XS151, XS223, and XS294.
BRILLIANT BLUE FCF	133	100	92, 161 & XS294	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Notes 92 and XS294 - Add Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294.
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP		4	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Notes XS38, XS151, XS223, and XS294.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R,		Colour	Do not consider in this food category

Category No. 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3)

			XS320 XS323R			
CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	50000	161 & XS294	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 50000 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS294 - Add Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Do not consider in this food category
CHLOROPHYLLS	140	GMP		4	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500		4	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294.
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161 & XS294	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS294 - Add Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294
GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT	163(ii)	100	161, 181 & XS294	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Notes 181 and XS294 - Add Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294

Category No. 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3)

INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE)	132	300	161 & XS294	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 200 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS294 - Add Notes XS38, XS151 and XS223
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	GMP		4	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	15	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 39, XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294.
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	500	161 & XS294	2023	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Lower use level to 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS294 - Add Notes XS38, XS151 and XS223
TARTRAZINE	102	500		4	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Notes XS38, XS151, XS223 and XS294.

Category No. 04.2.2.8 (Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 323R-2017: Dried Laver Products and Roasted Laver Product—No food additives are permitted, Seasoned Laver Products Only acidity regulators, anticaking agents, flavour enhancers, sweeteners, thickeners and antioxidants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food categories 04.2.2.2 and 04.2.2.8 or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in seasoned laver products (see Section 2.3.3) conforming to this standard; **CODEX STAN 334R-2020:** No food additives permitted

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

Category No. 04.2.2.8 (Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds)

ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8, XS323R	3	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 8, XS323R and XS334R.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185, XS323R	4	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	80000	92, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320 XS323R		Colour	Do not consider in this food category
CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	50000	161 & XS323R	2024	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level of 50000 mg/kg - Remove Note 161 - Maintain Note XS323R - Adopt Note XS334R
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	50000	92, 161, XS57, XS66, XS294, XS308R, XS320, XS323R	(2024)	Colour	Adopt at 20000 mg/kg with XS323R and XS334R and New Note "For use only in tsukudani (seaweed boiled down in soy sauce) to standardize and restore colour lost due to thermal processing.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	50	39, XS323R	2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Notes 39, XS323R and XS334R.

Category No. 05.4 (Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces)

Corresponding commodity standards: There are no corresponding commodity standards.

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

Category No. 04.2.2.8 (Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds)

LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	500		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 05.4 is not in the Annex to Table 3
----------------------------	---------	-----	--	---	--------	---

Category No. 06.1 (Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 153-1985:** Does not discuss food additives; **CODEX STAN 169-1989:** Does not discuss food additives; **CODEX STAN 172-1989:** Does not discuss food additives; **CODEX STAN 198-1995:** Does not discuss food additives; **CODEX STAN 201-1995:** Does not discuss food additives; **CODEX STAN 202-1995:** No food additives permitted; **CODEX STAN 333-2019:** No food additives permitted

GSFA: FC is in the Annex to Table 3.

General Comments on this FC by EWG members on the 1st circular:

China: Does not allow the use of colors in this FC and does not support adoption.

If there is support from other members and the provisions are adopted, perhaps the note “Some Codex members allow the use of additives with sweetener and colour functions in this food category while others limit this food category to products without these additives” should be added.

Switzerland: does not allow colours in this FC

Category No. 06.1 (Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	500	184 & 185	4	Colour	Discontinue
BEET RED	162	GMP	184	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP	184	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 06.3 (Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Category No. 06.3 (Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AMARANTH	123	300		7	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	75	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 75 mg/kg with Note 8 and New Note "Except for use at 100 mg/kg in extruded and/or puffed cereal products."
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	75	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 30 mg/kg with Note 185.
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 70 mg/kg.
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 160 mg/kg.
BROWN HT	155	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 30 mg/kg.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	50000		4	Colour	Adopt at 2500 mg/kg.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with revised New Note: "Except for use at 500 mg/kg in extruded-type breakfast cereals, including granola-type cereals, only".
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	120	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 120 mg/kg with Note 39.
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	200		7	Colour	Adopt at 70 mg/kg.
SUNSET YELLOW FCF	110	300	161	2008	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 300 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
TARTRAZINE	102	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 300 mg/kg.
ZEAXANTHIN, SYNTHETIC	161h(i)	100		4	Colour	Discontinue: Zeaxanthin, synthetic is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 06.3 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC**General Comments on FC 06.4.2 by EWG members on the 1st circular:****China:** Does not allow the use of colors in this FC and does not support adoption.

If there is support from other members and the provisions are adopted, perhaps the note “Some Codex members allow the use of additives with sweetener and colour functions in this food category while others limit this food category to products without these additives” should be added.

Switzerland: does not allow colours in this FC**Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)**

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AMARANTH	123	100		7	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note 8 (“As bixin”) and Note 211 (“For use in noodles only”) <i>Chair’s Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 25 mg/kg with Note 211 (“For use in noodles only”) <i>Chair’s Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
BEET RED	162	GMP		7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 211 (“For use in noodles only”)

Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)

						<i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP		7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only").
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	50000		4	Colour	Discontinue
CHLOROPHYLLS	140	GMP		7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only") <i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500		7	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only") <i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
LYCOPENE, BLAKESLEA TRISPORA	160d(iii)	100	211	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only").
LYCOPENE, SYNTHETIC	160d(i)	100	211	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only").

Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)

LYCOPENE, TOMATO	160d(ii)	100	211	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only").
TARTRAZINE	102	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 70 mg/kg with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only").

Category No. 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 249-2006: Acidity regulators, anticaking agents, antioxidants, colours, emulsifiers, flour treatment agents, humectants, preservatives, stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products) and only certain Table 3 acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, emulsifiers, flavour enhancers, humectants, stabilizers, and thickeners as indicated in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AMARANTH	123	100	153	7	Colour	Discontinue <i>Chair's Note: There is already an adopted provision for Amaranth in the GSFA due to alignment of CXS 249-2006 (Standard for Instant Noodles).</i>
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8 & 153	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 8 ("As Bixin") and Note 211 ("For use in noodles only") <i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	153 & 185	4	Colour	Adopt at 25 mg/kg with Note 185 ("As norbixin") and Note 211 ("For use in noodles only") <i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of</i>

Category No. 06.4.3 (Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products)

						<i>notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	50000	153	4	Colour	Adopt at 50000 mg/kg with XS249.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	153	7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only") <i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	120	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 120 mg/kg with Note 39 ("On a total carotenoid basis") with Note 211 ("For use in noodles only") <i>Chair's Note: There appears to be confusion (perhaps only for the Chair) regarding the proposals for use of notes that would allow the color to be used in pastas (either with or without vegetables or sauces). We ask that any member interested in adding such a note come to the meeting with a clear proposed note (taking into account the already proposed Note 211).</i>
TARTRAZINE	102	300	153	7	Colour	Adopt at 70 mg/kg with Note 153.

Category No. 06.5 (Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding))**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

Category No. 06.5 (Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding))

AMARANTH	123	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 80 mg/kg.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	30	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note 8.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	40	134 & 185	4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes 134, 185 and New Note: "Except for use in starch-based desserts and puddings at 50 mg/kg."
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg.
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg.
BROWN HT	155	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 30 mg/kg.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	50000		4	Colour	Adopt at 1000 mg/kg.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 150 mg/kg.
FAST GREEN FCF	143	100	161	2009	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg - Remove Note 161
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	150		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 06.5 is not in the Annex to Table 3
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	70	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 39.
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	150		7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg.
TARTRAZINE	102	300		7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg
ZEAXANTHIN, SYNTHETIC	161h(i)	100		4	Colour	Discontinue: Zeaxanthin, synthetic is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 06.5 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Category No. 06.6 (Batters (e.g. for breading or batters for fish or poultry))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AMARANTH	123	100		7	Colour	Discontinue
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 80 mg/kg with Note 8.
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 185.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	50000		4	Colour	Adopt at 2500 mg/kg
CURCUMIN	100(i)	20		7	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg.
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	120	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 39.

Category No. 06.7 (Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 355R-2023: Colours and stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192:1995) in food category 06.7 “Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)” and acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, preservatives, stabilizers, emulsifiers, flavor enhancers and thickeners, as indicated in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. The flavourings used in products covered by this standard should comply with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CXG 66-2008)

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	500	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 1 mg/kg with Note 185.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	50000		4	Colour	Discontinue
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	30	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 160 mg/kg with Note 39.

Category No. 06.8.1 (Soybean-based beverages)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 322R-2015: Only those additive functional classes indicated as technologically justified in Table 2 may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. In accordance with Section 4.1 of the Preamble to the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), additional additives may be present in non-fermented soybean products as a result of carry-over from soybean ingredients; Commodity Standards associated with subcategories

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	10		4	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note 8 (“As bixin”) and New Note “Except for use in products conforming to the Regional Standard for Non-fermented Soybean Products (CXS 322R-2015) at 5 mg/kg, as bixin.”
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	15	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with Notes 39 and XS322R.

						<i>Request guidance from CCASIA regarding the technological justification for the use of Paprika extract in flavoured soybean beverages in products conforming to CXS 322R-2015.</i>
PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A)	124	50		7	Colour	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note XS322R
TARTRAZINE	102	30		4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with New Note "Except for use in products conforming to the Regional Standard for Non-fermented Soybean Products (CXS 322R-2015) at 300 mg/kg."

Category No. 06.8.4.2 (Deep fried semi-dehydrated soybean curd)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 322R-2015: Only certain acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, emulsifiers, firming agents, flavour enhancer, preservatives, stabilizers and sweeteners indicated as technologically justified in Table 2 may be used for the product categories specified. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the table, only those food additives listed may be used and only within the functions and limits specified. In accordance with Section 4.1 of the Preamble to the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), additional additives may be present in non-fermented soybean products as a result of carry-over from soybean ingredients.

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Currently, no food additives are in this food category.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	35	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 39; add Note XS322R

Category No. 06.8.8 (Other soybean protein products)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 175-1989: No food additives permitted

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
LYCOPENE, TOMATO	160d(ii)	10000	GMP	3	Colour	Discontinue: Lycopene, Tomato is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 06.8.8 is not in the Annex to Table 3
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	5	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 5 mg/kg with Note 39, Note XS175, and New Note "Except for use in soybean substitute fish at 20 mg/kg"

Category No. 08.0 (Meat and meat products, including poultry and game)

Corresponding commodity standards: Commodity Standards associated with subcategories

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
AZORUBINE (CARMOISINE)	122	500	16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BRILLIANT BLACK (BLACK PN)	151	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
BROWN HT	155	500	16	7	Colour	Discontinue
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	200000	4 & 16	4	Colour	Discontinue
QUINOLINE YELLOW	104	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue
TARTRAZINE	102	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 08.1.1 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, whole pieces or cuts)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: Parent FC is in the Annex to Table 3.

General Comments on FC 08.1.1 by EWG members on the 1st circular:

China: Suggests to discontinue. The use of colors, especially red colors in this FC, may disguise the quality of products and mislead consumers.

Switzerland: allows no colours in this FC except INS 129, INS 133 and INS 155 for the purpose of health marking

Category No. 08.1.1 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, whole pieces or cuts)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
BEET RED	162	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 4
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 4
CHLOROPHYLLS	140	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 4
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	4 & 16	7	Colour	Adopt at 300 mg/kg with Note 4

Category No. 08.1.1 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, whole pieces or cuts)

TITANIUM DIOXIDE	171	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with Note 4
------------------	-----	-----	--------	---	--------	--------------------------

Category No. 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: Parent FC is in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

<u>General Comments on FC 08.1.2 by EWG members on the 1st circular:</u> <u>China:</u> Suggests to discontinue. The use of colors, especially red colors in this FC, may disguise the quality of products and mislead consumers. <u>Request for General Comments on use of Notes 4 and 16 in FC 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted)</u> The descriptor for food category 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted) is as follows: “Untreated raw comminuted or mechanically deboned meat, poultry and game. Examples include: fresh beef (hamburger) patties; boerewors; fresh breakfast sausages; gehakt (chopped meat); loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage); fresh meatballs; mechanically deboned, ground and formed poultry pieces (with or without breading or coating); and fresh sausages (e.g. beef, Italian, and pork).” Please comment on the appropriateness of Note 4 (For use in decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product only) and Note 16 (For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only) for this food category. <u>EWG Comments</u> <u>Australia:</u> has struggled to correlate the various meat and meat products (such as the subcategory 08.1.2 requested here) within the GSFA compared to categories and permissions within Australia’s regulations. The only permission for use of permitted colours is for carcass stamping (‘applied to the outer surface of meat as a brand for the purposes of inspection or identification’). This is most consistent with note 4, and not note 16. However, Australia considers this would only apply with the colour being ‘carried over’ from earlier branding of meat and not a direct use for products in this FC. <u>Chile:</u> supports the comments of China, the use of red coloring in ground meat can mislead the consumer. <u>China:</u> Does not allow the use of colours in this FC, for the reason that using colours may disguise the quality of the products and mislead the consumers. China seeks more information under the circumstances in accordance with the Note 4 and Note 16, especially for the use in decoration, glaze, and coating. <u>EU:</u> In the EU, some colours (only INS 129, INS 133 and INS 155, i.e. chemically stable colours) are permitted in the category 08.1 ‘Fresh meat, poultry and game’ with the restriction ‘only for the purpose of health marking’. This corresponds to the GSFA Note 4. The EU also observes that the descriptor of the GSFA FC 08.1 refers to the use of colours for certification stamps (in line with the GSFA Note 4). The use of colours is not permitted in the EU for products described in the GSFA FC 08.1.1 and the EU shares the concern expressed by China as regards the potential to mislead the consumer. The EU considers that the GSFA Note 4 is not appropriate for this FC.

As regards the GSFA FC 08.1.2, the EU in general also shares the concern expressed by China as regards the potential to mislead the consumer if colours were used. However, the EU permits the use of colour in certain meat preparations that are traditional in certain EU Member States (curcumin at 20 ppm only in merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco; carmines at 100 ppm in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, mici, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca, chorizo fresco, cevapcici and pljeskavice; allura red at 25 ppm in breakfast sausages; caramels in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, mici, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco; annatto bixin and annatto norbixin at 20 ppm (each) in breakfast sausages; paprika extract at 10 ppm in merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca, chorizo fresco, bifteki, soutzoukaki and kebab; and beet red in merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco).

The EU considers that Note 4 is not appropriate for the GSFA FC 08.1.2. In the EU's view, the use of colours in FC 08.1.2 could be permitted only for particular products for which the use of colours is expected by the consumer (i.e. the consumer is not misled).

As regards the GSFA Note 16, in the EU there is a food category 'Casings and coatings and decorations for meat'. This category also covers 'decorations for meat', i.e. products used for decorating the surface of meat products, jelly coatings of meat products as well as glazing agents for meat. However, to the EU's understanding those products are relevant only to processed meat products, i.e. not relevant to the GSFA categories 08.1, 08.1.1 and 08.1.2.

Summary of Second Circular Comments Received on use of Notes 4 and 16 in FC 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted)

In general, there seemed to be a great deal of concern regarding the use of colours in food categories for fresh meat, as it is noted that they could be used to mislead the consumer. It was noted that the descriptor for FC 08.1 indicates that colours may be used for purposes of health markings: "For example, colours are used for certification stamps on the surfaces of fresh cuts of meat, and are indicated in the Food Category System with a notation for "stamping, marking or branding the product.". It was further noted that such use on fresh cuts of meat would likely be satisfied by Note 4 "For use in decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product only". It was also argued that Note 16 "For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only" was likely only relevant to processed meats.

Recommendations based on comments received

Based on the comments received, the following applications of Note 4 and 16 in regards to food categories 8.1 and its subcategories are proposed:

1. Note 4 (For use in decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product only) is appropriate for use with FC 08.1.1 (Fresh meat, poultry and game).
2. Note 4 is not appropriate for use in FC 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted).
3. Note 16 (For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only) is not appropriate for use in FC 08.1.1 or 08.1.2.

These are the practices that we propose to use moving forward with the Third Circular.

Category No. 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	4, 8, 16 & 94	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 8 and New Note "For use only in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco and mici".

Category No. 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted)

ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	1000	4, 16, 94 & 185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 185 and New Note “For use only in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco and mici”.
BEET RED	162	GMP	4, 16 & 117	7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with New Note “For use only in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco and mici”.
CARAMEL I - PLAIN CARAMEL	150a	GMP	4 & 16	7	Colour	Adopt at GMP with New Note “For use only in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco and mici”.
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	5000	335	2	Colour	Adopt at 2,000 mg/kg with New Note “For use only in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco and mici”.
CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	5000	335	2	Colour	Discontinue <i>Chair’s note: Caramel III – Ammonia Caramel (INS 150c) is already adopted in FC 08.0.</i>
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	5000	335	2	Colour	Discontinue <i>Chair’s note: Caramel IV – Sulfite Ammonia Caramel (INS 150d) is already adopted in FC 08.0.</i>
CHLOROPHYLLS	140	1000	4, 16 & 94	7	Colour	Discontinue
CURCUMIN	100(i)	20	4, 16 & 117	7	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with New Note “For use only in breakfast sausages, merguez type products, salsicha fresca, butifarra fresca, longaniza fresca and chorizo fresco and mici”. <i>Chair’s Note: We have removed Note 117 (“Except for use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) at 1 000 mg/kg”).as part of the proposal to avoid confusion. If necessary to have the higher use level for loganiza sausage, a new note will need to be added to avoid confusion with other new note (e.g. A higher use level of 1000 mg/kg is permitted in in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage).</i>
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	GMP	4 & 16	4	Colour	Discontinue
TITANIUM DIOXIDE	171	1000	4, 16 & 94	7	Colour	Discontinue

Category No. 08.2 (Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 096-1981: Colours not permitted; CODEX STAN 097-1981: Colours not permitted; CODEX STAN 350R-2022: Antioxidants, and preservatives, used in accordance with the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 08.2 (processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard. Use of flavouring substances should be consistent with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CXG 66-2008); Commodity Standards associated with subcategories

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	16	7	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg; Add Notes XS96, XS97, and XS350R

Category No. 08.2.2 (Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 096-1981: Preservatives and humectants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 08.2.2 “Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts” and its parent food categories are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Only certain Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Use of flavouring substances should be consistent with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CAC/GL 66-2008). Section 4.1 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), referring to the conditions applying to carry-over of food additives from ingredients and raw materials into foods, shall apply; **CODEX STAN 097-1981:** Preservatives and humectants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 08.2.2 “Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts” and its parent food categories are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Only certain Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Use of flavouring substances should be consistent with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CAC/GL 66-2008). Section 4.1 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), referring to the conditions applying to carry-over of food additives from ingredients and raw materials into foods, shall apply

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3.

Category No. 08.2.2 (Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 8, Notes XS96, XS97, XS350R and New Note “ <i>Except for use in cooked ham and cooked chicken at 100 mg/kg to restore faded colour and improve the frying colour.</i> ”

Category No. 08.2.2 (Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts)

ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185, Notes XS96, XS97, XS350R and New Note <i>“Except for use in cooked ham and cooked chicken at 100 mg/kg to restore faded colour and improve the frying colour.”</i>
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	10	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 39; Add Notes XS96 and XS97

Category No. 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CARAMEL II - SULFITE CARAMEL	150b	5000	335	2	Colour	Adopt at 2000 mg/kg with Note 335 “For use in products containing vegetable protein only”
CARAMEL III - AMMONIA CARAMEL	150c	5000	335	2	Colour	Discontinue <i>Chair’s note: Caramel III – Ammonia Caramel (INS 150c) is already adopted in FC 08.0.</i>
CARAMEL IV - SULFITE AMMONIA CARAMEL	150d	5000	335	2	Colour	Discontinue <i>Chair’s note: Caramel IV – Sulfite Ammonia Caramel (INS 150c) is already adopted in FC 08.0.</i>

Category No. 08.3.1 (Non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
CURCUMIN	100(i)	20	118	7	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 118 and New Note <i>“Except for use in salsicha at 80 mg/kg”</i>

Category No. 08.3.1.1 (Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	20	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 8
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	1000	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 185
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	GMP		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 08.3.1.1 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Category No. 08.3.1.2 (Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 8
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185

Category No. 08.3.1.3 (Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	100	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 8
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	100	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185

Category No. 08.3.2 (Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 088-1981: Preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 08.3.2 “Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products” and its parent food categories are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Only certain Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Section 4.1 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), referring to the conditions applying to carry-over of food additives from ingredients and raw materials into foods, shall apply; **CODEX STAN 089-1981:** Preservatives, humectants and colours used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 08.3.2 “Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products” and its parent food categories are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Only certain Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Use of flavouring substances should be consistent with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CAC/GL 66-2008). Section 4.1 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), referring to the conditions applying to carry-over of food additives from ingredients and raw materials into foods, shall apply; **CODEX STAN 098-1981:** Preservatives, humectants and colours used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 08.3.2 “Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products” and its parent food categories are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Only certain Table 3 food additives (as indicated in Table 3) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard. Use of flavouring substances should be consistent with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings (CAC/GL 66-2008). Section 4.1 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), referring to the conditions applying to carry-over of food additives from ingredients and raw materials into foods, shall apply

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ALLURA RED AC	129	25	161, XS88, XS89 & XS98	2014	Colour	Revise adopted provision - Maintain use level at 25 mg/kg; - Maintain Notes XS88, XS89, and XS98

Category No. 08.3.2 (Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)

						- Remove Note 161
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	50	8	4	Colours	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with Note 8; Add XS88 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Corned Beef (CXS 88-1981)”, XS89 “Excluding products conforming to Standard for Luncheon Meat (CXS 89-1981)” and XS98 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Chopped Meat (CXS 98-1981)”
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	50	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185; Add XS88 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Corned Beef (CXS 88-1981)”, XS89 “Excluding products conforming to Standard for Luncheon Meat (CXS 89-1981)” and XS98 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Chopped Meat (CXS 98-1981)”
CURCUMIN	100(i)	20		7	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg; Add XS88 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Corned Beef (CXS 88-1981)”, XS89 “Excluding products conforming to Standard for Luncheon Meat (CXS 89-1981)” and XS98 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Chopped Meat (CXS 98-1981)”
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	40	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 40 mg/kg with Note 39; Add XS88 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Corned Beef (CXS 88-1981)”, XS89 “Excluding products conforming to Standard for Luncheon Meat (CXS 89-1981)” and XS98 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Chopped Meat (CXS 98-1981)”

Category No. 08.3.3 (Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

GSFA: FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	25	8	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 8; Add Note 16 “For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only”

Category No. 08.3.3 (Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products)**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC

ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 185; Add Note 16 <i>“For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only”</i>
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	16	7	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 16

Category No. 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings))**Corresponding commodity standards:** None**GSFA:** FC is not in the Annex to Table 3. Colours have previously been adopted in this FC**Request for comments pertaining to general questions about reporting basis and notes for FC 08.4 ((Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings))**

Food category 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)) is defined as “Casings or tubing prepared from collagen, cellulose, or food-grade synthetic material or from natural sources (e.g. hog or sheep intestines) that contain the sausage mix. The casing itself would not be intended to be eaten by itself, but rather only when filled with sausage mix. EWG members have indicated that the colour used in the casings is typically < 1% of the final sausage. Thus, a use level of 4000 mg/kg representing the amount of color considering the weight of the casing alone would correspond to a use level of approximately 40 mg/kg when considering the weight of the entire sausage. Both reporting bases (on the weight of the casing or the weight of the sausage) are likely used in FC 8.4.

At CCFA53, the Committee chose to list the use level for colours (Carotenal, Beta-Apo-8' (INS 160e); Carotenes, beta- (INS 160a(i),a(iii), a(iv); and Carotenes, beta-, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) on the basis of the weight of the whole sausage with the use of Note 304 (Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)). Other provisions in FC 08.4 (e.g., Polyglycerol esters of fatty acids (INS 475)) are reported on the weight of the casing only, and employ Note 365 (On a casings basis).

It would be of benefit to have guidance from the EWG members regarding which reporting basis is most appropriate for FC 08.4.

Question 1: Which reporting basis is most appropriate to report use levels for FC 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)). Please indicate a preference for one of the options, below, and please provide a reasoning for the choice of option.

Option 1: Use level reported based on the weight of the casing only using a note such as Note 365 (On a casings basis).

Option 2: Use level reported based on the weight of the whole sausage using a note such as Note 304 ((Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)).

Question 2: Many of the provisions for colours adopted in FC 08.4 in previous years include Note 16 (For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only.). Is Note 16 appropriate for the use of colours in edible casings, or is the note not needed?

EWG Comments pertaining to questions about FC 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings))

Australia: Supports option 2 (use level reported on the weight of the final product, i.e. sausage), therefore note 304 is appropriate (and not note 365). This is because it is the colour in the casing (and not in the sausage meat) that provides the colour of the final product that consumers expect and the final sausage is the food that consumers purchase.

Australia does not consider note 16 is appropriate for this FC 8.4. It also questions whether it is appropriate for a number of the earlier FC, as it notes in its comments. Australia would appreciate justification for this note from EWG members.

Canada: We support listing the maximum levels on the basis of the finished product as consumed (i.e., using Note 304). Although it may seem appropriate to list the maximum levels on the basis of the casing, as this is the food category, this may be one instance where this would not be appropriate. Consumers do not eat just casings, and it would be impossible to conduct an exposure assessment where data are for a food that is not likely widely reported. Instead, it would be sausages and similar encased foods that are captured in food consumption databases and which would be more informative in assessments.

Alternatively, the listing could be on the basis of the edible casing, but with an added note explaining the maximum residue level in the finished foods. However, this would create an inconsistency with other provisions and may be confusing unless all provisions were revised accordingly.

Regarding Note 16, it does not seem that a casing is consistent with use as a glaze or coating, and we would not support this Note for any provision in this food category.

China: Prefers Option1-Use level reported based on the weight of the casing only using a note such as Note 365 (On a casings basis).

Because Option 1 is more applicable for the actual producing process. While under Option 2, when it comes to upstream and downstream companies, for the upstream company producing edible casings only may not knowing the weight of the whole sausage.

EU: The EU appreciates the clarification provided for the relation between the MLs expressed on the basis of casings and on the basis of the final product (sausage). The EU considers that first and foremost a clarity and consistency is needed in expressing the MLs in the category 08.4. and that the MLs under discussion need to be adjusted accordingly, taking into account the reported, so that they achieve the intended technological effect. The MLs for the respective colours discussed in the respective category relevant for sausages (i.e. FC 08.3.1 and 08.3.2) give a good guidance of the range of the MLs needed in FC 08.4 (taking into account that the casings is typically < 1% of the final sausage).

Japan: Response to question 1: Japan supports Option 2. Option 2 can keep consistency with the recent decision of CCFA; Response to question 2: Japan considers Note 16 is not needed because it's obvious that edible casings in FC08.4 is the outside of the product.

UK: notes that food category 8.4 is for the edible casing and so it makes sense that the provisions be on a casings only basis, by reporting on a whole sausage basis colour could be derived from both the sausage meat and the casing, which is not the intention of the provision. If the note 'on a casings only basis' is used then note 16 is not required.

If the consensus opinion is that the provisions be on a whole sausage basis, then the Maximum use levels will need to be reduced to the 1% levels indicated in our responses to the first circular to reflect the proportion the casing makes up of the final product.

CCTA: Would support Option 2, as this helps to resolve the problem and would not require significant changes to the levels of colours currently permitted in this category. This only needs to be in relation to the use of colors not other additives, as the colouring function relates to the finished product needs not the casing. As stated the level of casing used is <1% so a level of 10,000 mg/kg in a casing for colour would only equate to < 100 mg/kg in the food as consumed.

Summary of Second Circular Comments Received regarding the appropriate reporting basis for FC 08.3 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings), and need for use of Note 16 (For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only)).

Comments on Question 1 (Which reporting basis is most appropriate to report use levels for FC 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings))).

Several comments were received, and good arguments were made for both having the reporting basis on the weight of the casing (Option 1) or the weight of the whole sausage (Option 2). The most compelling argument (at least in the Chair's opinion) was that casings are not typically eaten by themselves, and that exposure to use of colour in the casings is most easily calculated when expressed on the weight of the sausage itself.

Comments on Question 2 (Is Note 16 appropriate for the use of colours in edible casings, or is the note not needed?)

The majority of respondents indicated their belief that Note 16 was not necessary for use in food category 08.4.

Recommendations based on comments received

1. Use levels for colours in provisions being considered by the GSFA EWG for FC 08.4 will be expressed on the basis of the whole food by use of Note 304 (Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage).)
2. Note 16 will not be recommended for any provisions for colours in FC 08.4 considered by this GSFA EWG.
3. The Committee should consider if a recommendation should be made to reconsider all colour provisions in FC 08.4 to make them consistent on the reporting basis (e.g. on the basis of the weight of the sausage).

Category No. 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings))

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED	160b(i)	1000	8 & 85	4	Colour	Adopt at 35 mg/kg with Notes 8 and Note 304 "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)." Add New Note "Except for use in red colour sausage at 100 mg/kg".
ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED	160b(ii)	20	85 & 185	4	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 185 and Note 304 "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)."
BROWN HT	155	5000		2	Colour	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 304 "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)."
CARMINES	120	500	16 & 178	Adopted 2005	Colour	Revise adopted provision -Lower use level to 100 mg/kg
CARMINES	120	10000	16 & 178	2	Colour	-Remove Note 16 - Maintain Note 178 - Add Note 304 - Add New Note "For use in casings for saveloy only".

Category No. 08.4 (Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings))

						Discontinue provision that is currently in the GSFA at Step 2.
CURCUMIN	100(i)	500	16	7	Colour	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 304 "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)."
IRON OXIDES	172(i)-(iii)	1000	72	Adopted 2005	Colour	Revise adopted provision -Lower use level to 50 mg/kg -Remove Note 72 (on the ready to eat basis) - Add Note 304 Discontinue provision that is currently in the GSFA at Step 2.
IRON OXIDES	172(i)-(iii)	5000	72	2	Colour	
LUTEIN FROM TAGETES ERECTA	161b(i)	GMP		4	Colour	Discontinue: Lutein from Tagetes Erecta is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 08.4 is not in the Annex to Table 3
PAPRIKA EXTRACT	160c(ii)	9000	39	2	Colour	Adopt at 90 mg/kg with Notes 39 and 304 "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)."
TARTRAZINE	102	300		2	Colour	Adopt at 3 mg/kg with Note 304 "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)."
ZEAXANTHIN, SYNTHETIC	161h(i)	GMP		4	Colour	Discontinue: Zeaxanthin, synthetic is a Table 3 food additive (GMP) and FC 08.4 is not in the Annex to Table 3

Appendix 2**ADOPTED PROVISION FOR ASPARTAME (INS 951) IN FC 07.1 FOR COMMENT ON THE ACTUAL USE LEVEL AND APPLICATION OF THE ALTERNATIVE NOTE**

1. Among several topics, the 54th CCFA requested the EWG on the GSFA to the 55th CCFA to consider:⁶
 - The adopted provision for aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1 for comment on the actual use level and application of the alternative Note.

Introduction:

2. To conclude the advancement of provisions for sweeteners through the step process and to address the remaining use of Note 161 in the GSFA associated with sweeteners, CCFA54 requested that the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA55 consider the adopted provision for aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1 for comment on the actual use level and application of the alternative note. During discussion of the provision for Aspartame in food category 07.1 during the GSFA physical working group at the 54th CCFA, it was noted that the use level for Aspartame (INS 951) in food category 07.1 and its subcategories was higher than the use level for the additive in food category 07.2 (Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes), which specifically includes sweetened products. It was recommended that the GSFA EWG for CCFA55 reconsider the actual use level and application of the alternative note used for sweeteners and colours in the same food category *“Some Codex members allow the use of additives with sweetener and colour functions in this food category while others limit this food category to products without these additives.”*

Working Document:

3. The EWG on the GSFA issued two circulars for this Appendix requesting comments on the adopted provision for aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1. The EWG was invited to provide comment on the actual use level and application of the alternative Note. The provision is presented in the format of Table 2 of the GSFA.
4. The current document presents the proposal for the provision under discussion in the format of the food categories listed in Table 2 of the GSFA.
5. The proposal is based upon a consensus approach taking into account the following information:
 - Historical discussions on the provision in previous sessions of CCFA; and
 - Comments provided by EWG members.
6. The recommendation is based on the “weight of evidence”; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.
7. A full compilation of comments submitted for Appendix 2 (Adopted provision for aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1 for comment on the actual use level and application of the alternative Note) to the two circulars are available [here](#).

⁶ REP24/FA, para. 105(iii)

Since this provision was under discussion by the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA54, comments provided at that meeting might advise on the use of aspartame (INS 951) in FC 07.1 (see [CCFA54 Report of the EWG on the GSFA](#)).

Category No. 07.1 (Bread and ordinary bakery wares)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal Approach: CCFA54 noted that consensus had been achieved regarding the adoption of the following alternative Note as a replacement for Note 161 for the horizontal approach to sweeteners and colours in FC 07.1 and its subcategories: "Some Codex members allow the use of additives with sweetener and colour functions in this FC while others limit this FC to products without these additives."

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ASPARTAME	951	4000	161 & 191	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Revise adopted provision by adopting at 1700 mg/kg, removing Note 161, retaining Note 191, and adding the alternative note (Note 398) from CCFA54 "Some Codex members allow the use of additives with sweetener and colour functions in this FC while others limit this FC to products without these additives." Chair's Note: <i>The proposal as written above is in the spirit of the compromise that was achieved at CCFA54 for the use of sweeteners in FC 07.1. We note that there are some countries that indicate a desire to keep the use level at 4000 mg/kg. We request that EWG members who indicate a need for a higher use level provide additional information to support the higher use level in this food category.</i>

NOTES:

Note 161: Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.

Note 191: If used in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962), the combined maximum use level, expressed as aspartame, should not exceed this level.

Alternative Note: Some Codex members allow the use of additives with sweetener and colour functions in this FC while others limit this FC to products without these additives.

Appendix 3**NEW AND REVISED PROVISIONS IN THE GSFA ENTERED INTO THE STEP PROCESS AT STEP 2 AS A RESULT OF CX/FA 24/54/8**

9. Among several topics, the 54th CCFA requested the EWG on the GSFA to the 55th CCFA to consider:⁷
- Proposed new and revised provisions entered into the step process at Step 2 as a result of CX/FA 24/54/8

Introduction:

10. The PWG on the GSFA to CCFA54 considered submissions received in reply to the Circular Letter requesting proposals for new and/or revision of food additive provisions of the GSFA (CL 2023/46-FA) and made recommendations as to which proposals to revise adopted provisions in the GSFA should be included in the GSFA at Step 2. CCFA54 considered the proposals and agreed to include certain provisions in the GSFA at Step 2 and to circulate those provisions for comment.⁸

Working Document:

11. The EWG on the GSFA issued three circulars for this Appendix requesting comments on the proposed new and revised provisions entered into the step process at Step 2 as a result of CX/FA 24/54/8.
12. The current document presents proposals for each provision under discussion (adopt, adopt with revision, discontinue) in the format of the food categories listed in Table 2 of the GSFA.
13. These proposals are based upon a consensus approach taking into account the following information:
- Information on corresponding Codex commodity standards and the use of food additives in those commodity standards is provided for each food category; and
 - Comments provided by EWG members.
14. These recommendations are based on the “weight of evidence”; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.
15. A full compilation of comments submitted for Appendix 3 (New and revised provisions in the GSFA entered into the step process at Step 2 as a result of CX/FA 24/54/8) to the three circulars are available [here](#).

⁷ REP 24/FA, para. 105(v)

⁸ REP 24/FA, Appendix IX

Category No. 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1, and 12.9.2.3)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: **CODEX-STAN 38-1981:** lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid; **CODEX-STAN 151-1985:** additives should conform with country legislation where product is sold, **CODEX-STAN 223-2001:** lists specific acidity regulators, flavour enhancers, flavourings, texturizers, thickening and stabilizing agents; **CODEX-STAN 260-2007:** Allows acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, antioxidants, colours, colour retention agents, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sequestrants, stabilizers and sweeteners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 in the corresponding FC or in Table 3; **CODEX-STAN 294-2023:** Allows acidity regulators, antioxidants, flavour enhancers, preservatives, and stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ACETIC ACID, GLACIAL	260	GMP	XS294	2023	Acidity regulator, preservative	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294
ACETIC ACID, GLACIAL	260	GMP		2	Acidity regulator, preservative	Discontinue
CALCIUM LACTATE	327	10000	58, XS294	2023	Acidity regulator, Emulsifying salt, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Thickener	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294
CALCIUM LACTATE	327	10000	58	2	Acidity regulator, Emulsifying salt, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Thickener	Discontinue
CITRIC ACID	330	GMP	XS294	2023	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Colour retention agent, Sequestrant	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294
CITRIC ACID	330	GMP		2	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Colour retention agent, Sequestrant	Discontinue
DISODIUM 5'-GUANYLATE	627	GMP	279, XS294	2023	Flavour enhancer	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294
DISODIUM 5'-GUANYLATE	627	GMP	279	2	Flavour enhancer	Discontinue
DISODIUM 5'-INOSINATE	631	GMP	279, XS294	2023	Flavour enhancer	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294
DISODIUM 5'-INOSINATE	631	GMP	279	2	Flavour enhancer	Discontinue
DISODIUM 5'-RIBONUCLEOTIDES	635	GMP	279, XS294	2023	Flavour enhancer	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294
DISODIUM 5'-RIBONUCLEOTIDES	635	GMP	279	2	Flavour enhancer	Discontinue
LACTIC ACID, L-, D-, and DL-	270	GMP	XS294	2023	Acidity regulator	Revise Adopted provision removing Note XS294

LACTIC ACID, L-, D-, and DL-	270	GMP		2	Acidity regulator	Discontinue
------------------------------	-----	-----	--	---	-------------------	-------------

Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)**Corresponding Commodity Standards:** None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
METHACRYLATE COPOLYMER, BASIC (BMC)	1205	GMP		2	Carrier, Glazing agent	Adopt provision at GMP with notes: -Note 606: "For use in accordance with general principles for the addition of essential nutrients to foods (CAC/GL9-1987)" - Note 608: "For use only in nutrient-fortified products"; and - Note 256 ("For use in noodles, gluten-free pasta and pasta intended for hypoproteic diets only."

Category No. 09.1.2 (Fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: CODEX-STAN 292-2008: No additives permitted in Live Bivalve Molluscs, Raw Bivalve Molluscs allow antioxidants from appropriate FCs in Tables 1 and 2; CODEX-STAN 312-2013: No additives permitted; CODEX STAN 315-2014: No additives permitted in Scallop Meat and Roe-on Scallop Meat; acidity regulators, humectants, sequestrants and stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 are allowed in Quick Frozen Scallop Meat and Quick Frozen Roe-on Scallop Meat Processed With Phosphates

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
4-HEXYLRESORCINOL	586	50	New Note: "For use in crustaceans only" New Note: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg"	2	Antioxidant, Colour retention agent	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with the following notes: - Note 640: "For use in crustaceans only" -Note 641: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg" -XS292, XS312 and XS315

Category No. 09.2.1 (Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: CODEX STAN 36-1981: Allows antioxidants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX STAN 92-1981: Allows acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, humectants and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX STAN 95-1981: Allows humectants, preservatives and antioxidants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX STAN 165-1989: Allows acidity regulators, antioxidants, humectants and thickeners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX STAN 190-1995: Allows antioxidants and humectants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX STAN 191-1995: No additives permitted; CODEX STAN 292-2008: No additives permitted in Live Bivalve Molluscs, Raw Bivalve Molluscs allow antioxidants from appropriate FCs in Tables 1 and 2; CODEX STAN 312-2013: No additives permitted; CODEX STAN 315-2014: No additives permitted in Scallop Meat and Roe-on Scallop Meat; acidity regulators, humectants, sequestrants and stabilizers used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 are allowed in Quick Frozen Scallop Meat and Quick Frozen Roe-on Scallop Meat Processed With Phosphates

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

4- HEXYLRESORCINOL	586	50	New Note: "For use in crustaceans only" New Note: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg"	2	Antioxidant, Colour retention agent	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with the following notes: - Note 640: "For use in crustaceans only" - Note 641: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg" - Notes XS36, XS165, XS190, XS191, XS292, XS312, and XS315
-----------------------	-----	----	---	---	-------------------------------------	--

Category No. 09.2.4.2 (Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)**Corresponding Commodity Standards:** None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
4- HEXYLRESORCINOL	586	50	New Note: "For use in crustaceans only" New Note: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg"	2	Antioxidant, Colour retention agent	Discontinue provision as 4-hexylresorcinol is only present due to carryover. <i>Chair's note: Most comments suggest the provision is only present as a result of carryover from other food categories.</i>

Category No. 09.2.5 (Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: CODEX-STAN 167-1989: Allows preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2, CODEX-STAN 189-1993: No additives permitted; CODEX-STAN 222-2001: Allows flavour enhancers and sequestrants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX-STAN 236-2003: No additives permitted; CODEX-STAN 244-2004: Allows acidity regulators, antioxidants and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2; CODEX-STAN 311-2013: No additives permitted in smoke-dried fish, in Smoked Fish and Smoke-Flavoured Fish acidity regulators, colours, and preservatives used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 are allowed, as are certain Table 3 acidity regulators, antioxidants and packaging gases

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
4- HEXYLRESORCINOL	586	50	New Note: "For use in crustaceans only" New Note: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg"	2	Antioxidant, Colour retention agent	Discontinue provision as 4-hexylresorcinol is only present due to carryover. <i>Chair's note: Most comments suggest the provision is only present as a result of carryover from other food categories.</i>

Category No. 09.4 (Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: CODEX-STAN 3-1981: No additives permitted; CODEX-STAN 37-1981: Allows acidity regulators, colours, and sequestrants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2, as well as certain Table 3 acidity regulators; CODEX-STAN 70-1981: Allows acidity regulators used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2, as well as certain Table 3 acidity regulators, emulsifiers, gelling agents, stabilizers and thickeners; additionally only natural flavouring substances, natural flavouring complexes and smoke flavourings are permitted in products covered by this Standard; CODEX-STAN 90-1981: Allows Acidity regulators and sequestrants used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2, as well as certain Table 3 acidity regulators and flavour enhancers; CODEX-STAN 94-1981: Allows only certain Table 3 acidity regulators, emulsifiers, gelling agents, stabilizers and thickeners, additionally only natural flavouring substances, natural flavouring complexes and smoke flavourings are

permitted in products covered by this Standard; **CODEX-STAN 119-1981:** Allows only certain Table 3 acidity regulators, emulsifiers, gelling agents, stabilizers and thickeners, additionally only natural flavouring substances, natural flavouring complexes and smoke flavourings are permitted in products covered by this Standard

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
4-HEXYLRESORCINOL	586	50	New Note: "For use in crustaceans only" New Note: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg"	2	Antioxidant, Colour retention agent	Discontinue provision as 4-hexylresorcinol is only present due to carryover. <i>Chair's note: Most comments suggest the provision is only present as a result of carryover from other food categories.</i>

Category No. 12.2.1 (Herbs and spices)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: **CODEX-STAN 326-2017:** Preservatives used in accordance with Table 1 and 2 of GSFA allowed for use in green peppers only; **CODEX-STAN 327-2017:** Anticaking agents in Table 3 of the GSFA permitted in ground cumin only; **CODEX-STAN 328-2017:** Preservatives used in accordance with Table 1 and 2 of GSFA allowed for use in ground thyme only; **CODEX-STAN 342-2021:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard; **CODEX-STAN 343-2021:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard, also allows Sulphur Dioxide, and Calcium oxide; **CODEX-STAN 344-2021:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard; **CODEX-STAN 345-2021:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard; **CODEX-STAN 347-2019:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard; **CODEX-STAN 351-2022:** No food additives permitted; **CODEX-STAN 352-2022:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard; **CODEX-STAN 353-2022:** Allows anticaking agents listed in Table 3 in powdered form of foods conforming to this standard

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
METHACRYLATE COPOLYMER, BASIC (BMC)	1205	GMP	XS326, XS327, XS328, XS342, XS343, XS344 XS345, XS347, XS351, XS352, XS353	2	Carrier, Glazing agent	Adopt provision at GMP with notes: - Note 606: "For use in accordance with general principles for the addition of essential nutrients to foods (CAC/GL9-1987)" - Note 608: "For use only in nutrient-fortified products"; and - Notes XS326, XS327, XS328, XS342, XS343, XS344 XS345, XS347, XS351, XS352, XS353

Category No. 13.2 (Complementary foods for infants and young children)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: **CODEX-STAN 73-1981:** Acidity regulators, antioxidants, emulsifiers, packaging gases and thickeners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 13.2 (Complementary foods for infants and young children) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard; **CODEX-STAN 74-1981:** Acidity regulators, anticaking agents, antioxidants, carriers, emulsifiers, packaging gases, raising agents and thickeners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in food category 13.2 (Complementary foods for infants and young children) are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard. Only the food additives listed in food category 13.2 (Complementary foods for infants and young children) of the CXS 192-1995 may be present in the foods conforming to this Standard, as a result of carry-over from a raw material or other ingredient (including food additive) used to produce the food, subject to the following conditions:

- a) The amount of the food additive in the raw materials or other ingredients (including food additives) does not exceed the maximum level specified; and

b) The food into which the food additive is carried over does not contain the food additive in greater quantity than would be introduced by the use of the raw materials or ingredients under good manufacturing practice, consistent with the provisions on carry-over in the Preamble of the CXS 192-1995.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
METHACRYLATE COPOLYMER, BASIC (BMC)	1205	GMP		2	Carrier, Glazing agent	Hold provision pending determination of technological justification by CCNFSDU for use of BMC in FC 13.2.

Category No. 14.2.3 (Grape wines)

Corresponding Commodity Standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
MANNOPROTEINS FROM YEAST CELL WALLS	455	400		2	Stabilizer	Adopt at 400 mg/kg
METATARTARIC ACID	353	100		2	Stabilizer	Adopt at 100 mg/kg

NOTES:

Note 58: As calcium.

Note 279: Except for products conforming to the standard for Edible Fungi and Fungus Products (CXS 38-1981).

Note XS294: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Gochujang (CXS 294-2009).

Note XS326: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Black, White and Green Peppers (CODEX STAN 326-2017).

Note XS327: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cumin (CODEX STAN 327-2017).

Note XS328: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried Thyme (CODEX STAN 328-2017).

Note XS342: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried Oregano (CODEX STAN 342-2021).

Note XS343: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried or Dehydrated Ginger (CODEX STAN 343-2021).

Note XS344: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cloves (CODEX STAN 344-2021).

Note XS345: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried Basil (CODEX STAN 345-2021).

Note XS347: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried or Dehydrated Garlic (CODEX STAN 347-2019).

Note XS351: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried Floral Parts – Saffron (CODEX STAN 351-2022).

Note XS352: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried Seeds – Nutmeg (CODEX STAN 352-2022).

Note XS353: Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried or Dehydrated Chilli Pepper and Paprika (CODEX STAN 353-2022).

New Note: "Residue levels in crustaceans <1 mg/kg"

Removal of Note 381 for all adopted provisions in food categories 13.1.1, 13.1.2 and 13.1.3

One Observer Organization put forward a request to add provisions at Step 2 for all adopted provisions in food categories 13.1.1 (Infant formulae), 13.1.2 (Follow-up formulae), and 13.1.3 (Formulae for special medical purposes for infants) to remove Note 381 “As consumed.” This would result in the removal of Note 381 from 96 adopted provisions detailed in Annex 5 of FA54/CRD02.

In support of the removal of Note 381 from these provisions, it was noted that Section 6 of the preamble to the GSFA indicates that “Unless otherwise specified, maximum use levels for additives in Tables 1 and 2 are set on the final product as consumed.” Despite this, all additive provisions within FCs 13.1.1, 13.1.2, and 13.1.3 include Note 381 “as consumed,” while the provisions in FCs 13.2, 13.3, 13.4, 13.5, and 13.6 do not include this Note. This inconsistency in the application of the “as consumed” Note (which is redundant with the clause in Section 6 of the preamble of the GSFA) within the FC 13 products has led to confusion in the interpretation of the maximum use levels. Removal of Note 381 from the provisions in FCs 13.1.1, 13.1.2, and 13.1.3 would create consistency on how the “as consumed” Note is applied, allowing all provisions to reference the statement in Section 6 of the preamble. This approach was discussed and supported by at least one Codex Member at CCFA53, with a note that the use of these notes could be addressed by CCFA through a submission of a proposal to revise the GSFA (REP23/FA para. 64).

Final EWG Proposal

Replace Note 381 (“As consumed”) in provisions in food categories 13.1.1., 13.1.2, and 13.1.3 with the new note “*Formulae products in food categories 13.1.1 (Infant formulae), 13.1.2 (Follow-up formulae), and 13.1.3 (Formulae for special medical purposes for infants) are available in powder form (which requires mixture with water before consumption), concentrated liquid form (which requires dilution with water before consumption), and ready to drink form. In all cases, consistent with the language in Section 6 of the Preamble to the GSFA, the maximum level listed in the GSFA is for the final product as consumed.*”

This action is proposed to be undertaken by revising the adopted provisions in FCs 13.1.1, 13.1.2 and 13.1.3 by deleting Note 381 and replacing it with the new proposed note. The provisions at Step 2 in the same food categories would be discontinued.

While it is likely appropriate for the committee to consider the use of Note 381 in all subcategories of FC 13.0 at a future time, the current exercise of the GSFA EWG was only to consider the provisions put forward at Step 2 with regard to the removal of Note 381 in FCs 13.1.1, 13.1.2 and 13.1.3.